



HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION

Quality Services for a Quality Community

MEMBERS

Daniel Baum, Chair
Patrick Cannon
Karen Hoene
Carla McWherter, Vice Chair
Liz Miller
Talyce Murray

AGENDA

June 5, 2019, 7:00 PM

Court City Council Conference Room
East Lansing, MI 48823

City Council Liaison

Aaron Stephens

Staff Liaison

Shelli Neumann
(517) 319-6893

City of East Lansing DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN RESOURCES

410 Abbot Road
East Lansing, MI 48823

(517) 337-1731

www.cityofeastlansing.com

- 1) Opening
 - A) Roll Call
 - B) Review of Agenda for June 5, 2019
 - C) Approval of Minutes for May 1, 2019
- 2) Public Comment
- 3) Written Correspondence
- 4) Council Liaison Comments
- 5) Staff Liaison Comments
- 6) Commissioner Concerns
- 7) Old Business
 - 1) Public Safety Review Board
 - 2) *Coffee & Conversation*—HRC Monthly Event
- 8) Adjournment

CALENDAR:

January, Stalking Awareness Month
January, Martin Luther King Jr. Day
March 7, East Lansing's Ban on Discrimination Based on Sexual Orientation
April 7 -13 Crime Victims' Week
April, Sexual Assault Awareness Month
July 26, Anniversary of the Passage of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA)
October, Domestic Violence Awareness Month & Breast Cancer Awareness Month

PLEASE NOTE: Meeting starts at 7:00 PM and will be held in the Court/City Council Conference Room. If you will not be at the meeting, please call Shelli Neumann (319-6893).

Comments on East Lansing Draft Ordinance Creating a Public Safety Review Board

Erick Williams, June 2, 2019

Access to Information

It is important for the Board to exercise independent judgment. To exercise independent judgment, the Board needs independent access to information, such as (a) access to Police and Fire Department complaint and investigation files and the underlying evidence, (b) access to state and federal litigation records and the city's underlying investigations in those cases, and (c) the board needs authority to gather information directly and at its own discretion. Without independent access to information, the Board will be unable to exercise independent judgment.

Ordinances in other jurisdictions contain language to this effect:

Knoxville gives its committee the power to subpoena witnesses.
http://knoxvilletn.gov/UserFiles/Servers/Server_109478/File/parc/ordinance_019401.pdf

New Orleans, gives its police monitor the power to review city records relating to police misconduct lawsuits. The police monitor also has access to officer disciplinary proceedings and all materials in those proceedings. http://neworleans-la.elaws.us/code/coor_ptii_ch2_artxiii_sec2-1121

St Paul gives its board power to review all police department complaint investigations, to access all investigatory materials and reports. The board also has the power to subpoena witnesses.
<https://www.stpaul.gov/sites/default/files/Media%20Root/Human>

[%20Rights%20%26%20Equal%20Economic%20Opportunity/PCI ARC%20Ordinance.pdf](#)

San Diego allows its board to review the police department's investigations and related material.

<https://www.sandiego.gov/sites/default/files/crb-sop.pdf>

The St Louis ordinance allows the oversight board to monitor police department internal affairs investigations and copy all recordings and evidence. When the police department finishes an investigation, it sends its entire file to the board.

<https://www.stlouis-mo.gov/internal-apps/legislative/upload/Ordinances/BOAPdf/ordinance69984.pdf>

Recommend Changes in Procedure

The Board should be proactive. One purpose of an oversight board is to prevent adverse incidents. Once an incident happens or a lawsuit is filed, it may be too late. The Board needs authority to gather information prospectively and recommend changes in procedure even when a complaint has not been filed.

Ordinances in other jurisdictions contain language to this effect:

In Berkeley, the police review commission has the power to make recommendations regarding law enforcement operations.

https://www.cityofberkeley.info/Police_Review_Commission/Home/Ordinance_4644.aspx

In Cambridge, MA, the board may investigate complaints concerning the police department rules and regulations.

https://library.municode.com/ma/cambridge/codes/code_of_ordinances?nodeId=TIT2ADPE_CH2.74POREADBO

In Seattle (King County, WA), the oversight office has the powder to review and recommend changes to sheriff's office policies, rules, procedures and general orders.

https://www.kingcounty.gov/~media/independent/law-enforcement-oversight/Documents/2019/Ordinance_18500.ashx?la=en

In Knoxville, the committee can make recommendations to improve police policies and activities.

http://knoxvilletn.gov/UserFiles/Servers/Server_109478/File/parc/ordinance_019401.pdf

In New Orleans, the police monitor can make recommendations to the police department to improve upon policies and practices based on national best practices. http://neworleans-la.elaws.us/code/coor_ptii_ch2_artxiii_sec2-1121

St Louis gives its board authority to make recommendations regarding, policy, operations and procedures without reference to a specific complaint. <https://www.stlouis-mo.gov/internal-apps/legislative/upload/Ordinances/BOAPdf/ordinance69984.pdf>

St Paul allows its commission to suggest policy changes for the police department's consideration.

<https://www.stpaul.gov/sites/default/files/Media%20Root/Human%20Rights%20%26%20Equal%20Economic%20Opportunity/PCIARC%20Ordinance.pdf>

San Diego authorizes its board to advocate for policies to promote fair and humane policing. The board can consider issues other than complaints. <https://www.sandiego.gov/sites/default/files/crb-sop.pdf>

Albuquerque requires its board to spend at least half its time working up policy recommendations.

<http://www.cabq.gov/cpoa/documents/amended-cpoa-ordinance.pdf>

Whistleblower Protection

It is important to encourage complaints from city employees, who are in a position to see problems before the public sees them. But employees may be reluctant to cooperate, especially in organizations like police and fire departments with paramilitary cultures. The ordinance should protect employees from retaliation when they choose to provide information to the Board.

Consider adopting something like section 2-78-160 of the Chicago ordinance, which forbids retaliation or intimidation against people who cooperate with the oversight board. <http://www.chicagocopa.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/COPA-Ordinance.pdf>

Independent Voice

It is important that the Board have an independent voice. The Board needs authority to publish freely its observations, opinions, and recommendations.

Consider adopting something like section 2-2213 (6) of the Atlanta ordinance, which gives the board discretion to issue public reports and recommendations at any time. https://acrbgov.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/16-O-1072_ACRB-ORDINANCE.pdf

Reports

It is important that the community know how the Board is performing. The Board should publish individual complaint summaries. The board should publish annual and historical statistics regarding the numbers and types of complaints and their outcomes.

For example, section 2-1106 (e) of the Knoxville ordinance requires annual publication of complaint summaries and statistics.

http://knoxvilletn.gov/UserFiles/Servers/Server_109478/File/parc/ordinance_019401.pdf

Research Before Adopting Ordinance

The city should do more research in this area -- possibly sponsor a study group – possibly consult with experts. According to the National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement, <https://www.nacole.org>, there are more than 150 civilian police oversight agencies in the USA. We should take advantage of those existing models.



HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION

Quality Services for a Quality Community

MINUTES

May 1, 2019–7:00 P.M.

Court/City Council Conference Room

East Lansing, MI 48823

MEMBERS

Daniel Baum, Chair
Patrick Cannon
Karen Hoene
Carla McWherter
Liz Miller
Talyce Murray
City Council Liaison
Aaron Stephens

Staff Liaison

Shelli Neumann
(517) 319-6893

City of East Lansing

DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN
RESOURCES

410 Abbot Road
East Lansing, MI 48823

(517) 337-1731

www.cityofeastlansing.com

1) **Opening**

A) Roll Call

Present at the meeting were Commissioners Baum, Cannon, Hoene, McWherter, Miller and Murray. Also present were Aaron Stephens, City Council Liaison, and Shelli Neumann, Staff Liaison.

B) Review of Agenda

The Commission approved the agenda for May 1, 2019. Motion by Cannon; second by Miller. All yeas; motion carried.

C) Approval of Minutes

The Commission approved the minutes for April 10, 2019. Motion by Murray; second by Hoene. All yeas; motion carried.

2) **Public Comment**

None

3) **Council Liaison Report**

Council member Stephens shared that there has recently been ICE activity in the Lansing area.

4) **Staff Liaison Report**

None

5) **Commissioner Concerns/Items**

Commissioner Baum noted that it is important that the HRC ensure that the values/practices/beliefs of organizations that the commission partners with are compatible with those of the Commission. Baum noted that St. Vincent Catholic Charities is opposed to LGBTQ individuals fostering/adopting. They are challenging the State of Michigan for refusing to work with their agency for their decision to turn away same-sex couples, or others who do not share their religious beliefs.

Commissioner Miller noted that there will be a community presentation called “Raising White Kids” at the East Lansing Public Library on Thursday, May 2, 6:30 PM.

Commissioner Hoene noted that the Michigan Historical Museum is currently hosting a traveling exhibit on “States of Incarceration.”

HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION

Quality Services for a Quality Community

6) **Old Business**

1. ELPD Complaint Process

Council member Stephens shared and discussed newly drafted Ordinance No. 1463, an ordinance that establishes a Public Safety Review Board. The Commission discussed many of the details provided for in the ordinance.

2. Future Events

Commissioners developed a draft list of dates/topics/Commissioner facilitators for *Coffee and Conversation*. (See attached document)

7) **New Business**

None

8) **Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 8:40 PM. Motion by Cannon; second by Hoene. All yeas; motion carried.

sln

East Lansing Human Relations Commission

Coffee & Conversation

Date	Topic	Commissioner	Location
July 21	Protected Class	Carla	
Aug. 17, 18	Religion Edition	Daniel & Pat	
Sept. 20, 21, 22	LGBTQ Edition	Talyce	
Oct. 19, 20	Disabilities & Accessibility	Karen	
Nov. 15, 16	Veterans Edition	Liz	
Dec. 16, 17			

Future Topics: Students
Race
Immigration
Incarceration
Police

Locations: Tim Horton's (Trowbridge)
Biggby
Espresso Royale (N. Tier)
Chapalure (Hannah Plaza)

HRC ATTENDANCE: 2019

Name	Term Expires	Jan 16	Feb 6	March 6	Apr 10	May 1	Jun 5	July X	Aug 7	Sep 4	Oct 2	Nov 6	Dec 4	TOTAL ABSENT
Baum, Daniel	2020	P	P	P	P	P		N						
Cannon, Pat	2020	P	P	P	P	P		O						
McWherter, Carla	2019	P	Ab	P	P	P		M						
Miller, Liz	2019	P	Ab	P	Ab	P		E						
Murray, Talyce	2019	Ab	Ab	Ab	P	P		E						
Watson, Dana	2021	P	P	X				T						
Hoene, Karen	2021	X	X	P	P	P		I						
								N						
								G						

P= Present

Ab=Absent

NA=Not Applicable